

CHARLESTON AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (CARTA)
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
February 16, 2022
Meeting Notes

A Charleston Area Regional Transportation Authority (CARTA) Board of Directors meeting was held at the Berkeley-Charleston-Dorchester Council of Governments in the Barrett Lawrimore Conference Room located at 5790 Casper Padgett Way in North Charleston, SC at 1:00 p.m. on Wednesday, February 16, 2022.

MEMBERSHIP: Mary Beth Berry; Ron Brinson; Mike Brown; Dwayne Green; Alfred Harrison; Will Haynie; Jenny Costa Honeycutt; John Iacofano; John Labriola; James Lewis; Pat O’Neil; Teddie Pryor; Christie Rainwater; Michael Seekings; Keith Summey; John Tecklenburg; Jimmy Ward; Robert Wehrman

MEMBERSHIP PRESENT: Mary Beth Berry; Ron Brinson; Will Haynie; John Iacofano; James Lewis; Michael Seekings; Robert Wehrman

PROXIES: Jerry Lahm for Teddie Pryor; Ray Anderson for Keith Summey; Robert Sommerville for John Tecklenburg; Lynn Christian for Alfred Harrison; Stephanie Tillerson for John Labriola

OTHERS PRESENT: David Bonner (Transdev); Alisha Wigfall (Transdev); Robert Flagler (Rawle-Murdy Associates); Scott Donahue (SCDOT); Samantha Dubay (HDR); Stefani Wilkens (HDR); John Mitchell (HDR); Shannon Meder (HNTB); William Hamilton (Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit); Helena Peltz (Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit); Brendan Patman (Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit); Millicent Middleton (Middleton-4-U); Russell Coletti (Northwoods Estates); Robert E. Milhous (Robert E. Milhous, CPA, PA & Associates – via video-conference); News Media

STAFF PRESENT: Ron Mitchum; Andrea Kozloski; Robin Mitchum; Sharon Hollis; Belen Vitello; Jon Dodson; John Lambert; Michelle Emerson; Daniel Brock; Kim Coleman

1. Call to Order

Chairman Seekings called the CARTA Board of Directors Meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. followed by a moment of silence and quorum determination.

2. Consideration of Board Minutes: January 19, 2022 Meeting

Mr. Anderson made a motion to approve the January 19, 2022 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

3. Financial Status Report – Robin Mitchum

Robin Mitchum, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, presented the financial status report for the period ending January 31, 2022. Ms. Mitchum noted that, overall, the agency remains in good shape and ended the month with unexpended funds of \$145,131. She reviewed the following activities for FY22 thus far:

Revenues:

- Farebox is the fares collected on the revenue vehicles.
- Passes are bus pass fares sold to customers.
- Local contributions are funds received from local organizations for shelter construction.
- The Federal revenue includes operating for the year-to-date. Federal revenue is recorded as eligible expenditures are incurred.
- Insurance proceeds are a result of accidents.
- Sale of Assets is the proceeds from the sale of a support vehicle, a 2016 Goshen, a 1996 New Flyer and shelter scrap metal.

Expenditures:

- Staff Salaries & Benefits include the cost of retiree insurance.
- Supplies include office, facility maintenance and PPE (masks) supplies.
- Printing includes cost of printing route maps, brochures and passes.
- Dues/Membership is CARTA’s membership with Transportation Association of South Carolina (TASC).
- Office Equipment Rental includes the monthly battery lease for the electric buses.

- Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) includes the FY22 portion of the Swiftly Transit Time and Insights, Cradlepoint NetCloud Essentials for mobile routes and Zscaler internet security, in addition to IT services.
- Rent includes the Ashley Phosphate Park & Ride lot, Dorchester Village Shopping Center Park & Ride lot, Leeds Avenue lot lease from SCE&G, SC works Trident lease space and document storage.
- Communications is the cost of phone, internet and radio services at the facilities and on the buses.
- Utilities include electric and water at the SuperStop, Melnick Park & Ride, the Radio Shop at Leeds Avenue and the charging stations at Leeds Avenue.
- Auditing is the cost of the actuary valuation for GASB 75 and the annual audit.
- Custodial Services is the cost of janitorial services at the Melnick Park & Ride location.
- Pilot Ride Program is customer transportation cost for same-day service through independent rideshare.
- Other Professional Services include appraisal fees for the Ladson property.
- Shared Contract Services (IGA & Management) is the extensive services the BCDCOG provides to CARTA.
- Fixed-Route Service is the cost of fixed and commuter service provided by Transdev.
- Money Transport is the cost of the armored guard service, Brinks, to pick up and transport cash deposits to the bank.
- Security Services is contracted security service provided at the SuperStop by the City of North Charleston Police Department.
- Electric Bus Master Plan is the project to develop the necessary planning documents to transition CARTA's diesel bus fleet to all-electric buses.
- Vehicle Maintenance is the cost to maintain the fleet.
- Facility Repair & Maintenance is the cost to maintain the SuperStop facility and maintenance on the fare vault.
- Operating Fees & Licenses include credit card transaction fees, storm water fees, solid waste user fees and vehicle title and registration fees.
- Insurance includes the cost of liability insurance provided by the Insurance Reserve Fund. The Policy renewed January 1, 2022 and this is the majority of the expenditures for FY22.
- Paratransit is the cost of paratransit transportation provided by Transdev.
- Interest is the interest accrued on the Melnick Park & Ride Loan.
- Non-Capitalized Assets include the purchase of additional driver and side shields on the buses.

Capital Expenditures:

- Rolling Stock is the purchase of three New Flyer buses and six Proterra buses.
- Bus Shelter Construction/Bench is the purchase of shelters.
- Security/Cameras & Equipment is the purchase of cameras at the SuperStop and the upgrading of the access control system at the Leeds Avenue facility.
- Capital includes the purchase of two diesel fuel pumps.

Ms. Mitchum stated that the amount owed to Transdev as of January 31, 2022 is \$1,271,119.65. Ms. Mitchum addressed questions and comments. The Board of Directors received the Financial Status Report as information.

4. FY21 Audit Presentation – Robert Milhous, CPA

Robert Milhous, with Robert E. Milhous, CPA, PA & Associates, delivered the FY21 Audit Presentation via video-conference. Mr. Milhous presented the FY21 Audit Report noting that all financial records were in order and in compliance with Government Auditing Standards. He explained the Auditor's Unmodified Opinion and delivered an overview of the Financial Statements. Mr. Milhous addressed questions and comments. Chairman Seekings thanked Mr. Milhous for his presentation and commended Mr. Mitchum and staff regarding the Audit Report. The Board of Directors received the FY21 Audit Presentation as information.

5. Re-Branding Request for Proposals – Request for Approval

Ron Mitchum, Executive Director, discussed the Re-Branding Request for Proposals. He stated that the CARTA Re-Branding Selection Committee met on February 8, 2022 and reviewed seven proposals for the CARTA Re-Branding project. Proposals were received from AFFIRM, FELLOW, HDR Engineering, Inc., M3 Agency, Rawle-Murdy, Tickety

Boo Creative and Zimmer-Design. Based on the overall score sheet rankings, the Selection Committee recommends that CARTA award a contract to HDR Engineering, Inc. Mr. Mitchum noted that signage colors need to be more noticeable coming from both directions in order for the riders and the drivers to be able to better recognize bus stop locations. He discussed the estimated costs associated with total hours and direct labor as well as the proposed schedule. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

Mr. Brinson made a motion to approve the Re-Branding Request for Proposal as presented.

Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

6. Transportation Network Company (TNC) Service Change – Request for Approval – Jon Dodson

Jon Dodson, Senior Transit Planner, presented the Transportation Network Company (TNC) Service Change. He noted that the CARTA OnDemand pilot program began in February 2021 to provide same-day, on-demand trips for seniors and customers with disabilities for peninsula-based trips to and from the Charleston Medical District. Since inception, the program has been expanded to cover the CARTA fixed-route service area as well as to serve additional medical facilities. Mr. Dodson explained that Uber is averaging approximately three trips per day and UZURV is averaging 0.5 trips a day. Ridership has seen limited growth with the expansion and sustained ridership growth is necessary for the contracted agencies to continue the partnership and for the program to remain active. He stated that staff is requesting approval to expand the service area to allow trips for all purposes rather than limiting the trips to medical appointments within the existing CARTA OnDemand service area. Mr. Dodson presented a map and discussed the existing OnDemand service area. He noted that the TNC pilot program would continue to be funded through a grant award from the Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities Program under Section 5310 of the Fixing America's Surface Transportation Act (FAST) as well as the re-allocation of the Route 204 funds. The total amount available for the pilot is \$180,000 of which 5.9% has been expended. Mr. Dodson stated that, upon Board approval, the program would be implemented immediately and would continue until the budget is exhausted or if ridership does not show growth over the next 60 days. Mr. Dodson and Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

Mr. Lewis made a motion to approve the Transportation Network Company (TNC) Service Change as presented.

Ms. Tillerson seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

7. Project Updates – Ron Mitchum/Staff

Mr. Mitchum delivered an update on the following projects, noting that progress is being made on all projects: Stop/Shelter Design Guidelines; Service Planning Initiatives; Electric Bus Master Plan; CARTA OnDemand; Shelter Improvement Program; Solar Lighting; Digital Signage; Shipwatch Square Transit Center; Vanpool Program; Lowcountry Rapid Transit. He noted that a summary was distributed in the Board Meeting Agenda Packet in advance of the meeting and encouraged Board Members to contact him or the respective project manager regarding any specific concerns or questions. In addition, he stated that a new hire will begin at the BCDCOG tomorrow as the Vanpool Program Coordinator. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments. The Board of Directors received the Project Updates Report as information.

8. Ridership Report – Jon Dodson

Mr. Dodson presented the Ridership Report as of January 31, 2022. He noted there were 9.1 customers per hour totaling 153,188 customers in January and that the on-time across all timepoints was 90%. Mr. Dodson stated that overall ridership from December 2021 to January 2022 was down 8%. Overall ridership comparing January 2021 to January 2022 increased by 11%. Overall ridership comparing January 2022 to January 2022 decreased by 42%. He noted that Route 203-MUSC had the highest riders per hour at 24. Additionally, 211-Meeting/King DASH (14), 10-Rivers Avenue (13), 20-King (12), 213-Lockwood DASH (12) and 11-Dorchester/Airport (10) had the next highest riders per hour. Mr. Dodson addressed questions and comments. The Board of Directors received the Ridership Report as information.

9. Executive Director's Report – Ron Mitchum

Mr. Mitchum noted that CARTA still does not know the full funding amount for the new fiscal year which began on October 1, 2021; the Agency is still operating under Continuing Resolution (CR). He stated that CARTA's ridership remains consistent with nation-wide ridership. Mr. Mitchum is hopeful that CARTA will receive a 30% increase in

Federal Funding. He also stated that the Agency is awaiting decisions for discretionary funding for Shipwatch Square construction, Downtown/DASH study (for future service expansion), US 52/78 BRT Service study, Summerville Transit study and TriCounty Link Demand Response study. Mr. Mitchum noted that the Leeds Avenue Bus Parking Expansion project is underway. However, the Battery Electric Bus Charging Infrastructure project has been delayed due to supply chain issues. Mr. Mitchum announced that David Bonner, General Manager with Transdev, has resigned his position to pursue other opportunities. Transdev will work with staff to identify a suitable replacement. Mr. Mitchum recognized Mr. Bonner and commended him for his dedicated service, hard work and, at times, stepping up to drive buses when there was a shortage of drivers. Mr. Bonner will be missed but is wished well by Chairman Seekings, the Board of Directors, Mr. Mitchum and staff. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments. The Board of Directors received the Executive Director's Report as information.

10. Other Business, If Any

There was no other business to discuss.

11. Public Comments, If Any

There were five public comments:

- Milicent Middleton, of Middleton 4 U, expressed her concerns regarding the service need on Johns Island and the surrounding Sea Islands and connections with TriCounty Link and rideshare services.
- Brendan Patman, Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, expressed his concerns regarding service from North Charleston to Mt. Pleasant stating that a route via I-526 with no wait or stops in Downtown Charleston is desired.
- Russell Coletti, President of Northwoods Estates Civic League, expressed his concerns regarding the bus stops located at Northwoods Estates.
- Helena Peltz, of Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, expressed her concerns regarding services for the homeless and disabled transit riders, noting that additional seats, sidewalks and shelters are desired as well as additional TriCounty Link service on the Sea Islands.
- William Hamilton, Executive Director of Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, expressed his concerns regarding bus stops in North Charleston and the LCRT's service not continuing to the Summerville area.

12. Board Comments, If Any

There was no other business to discuss.

13. Adjourn

Chairman Seekings thanked Board Members for their service. There being no further business before the Board, Chairman Seekings adjourned the meeting at 2:08 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Kim Coleman