

CHARLESTON AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (CARTA)
VIRTUAL BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
October 21, 2020
Meeting Notes

The Charleston Area Regional Transportation Authority (CARTA) Board of Directors held a virtual Board of Directors meeting at 1:00 p.m. on Wednesday, October 21, 2020.

MEMBERSHIP: Mary Beth Berry; Ron Brinson; Mike Brown; Brenda Corley; Dwayne Green; Alfred Harrison; Will Haynie; Anna Johnson; James Lewis; Pat O'Neil; Christie Rainwater; Vic Rawl; Michael Seekings; Elliott Summey; Keith Summey; John Tecklenburg; Jimmy Ward; Craig Weaver

MEMBERSHIP PRESENT: Mary Beth Berry; Ron Brinson; Mike Brown; Brenda Corley; Dwayne Green; Will Haynie; Anna Johnson; James Lewis; Pat O'Neil; Michael Seekings; John Tecklenburg; Jimmy Ward

PROXIES: Dennis Turner for Christie Rainwater; Jerry Lahm for Elliott Summey; Ray Anderson for Keith Summey; Lynn Christian for Alfred Harrison; Stephanie Tillerson for Craig Weaver; Devri DeToma for Vic Rawl

STAFF PRESENT: Ron Mitchum; Andrea Kozloski; Robin Mitchum; Jeff Burns; Sharon Hollis; Jon Dodson; Michelle Emerson; Morgan Grimes; Daniel Brock; Kim Coleman

OTHERS PRESENT: David Bonner (Transdev); Marquel Coaxum (Rawle-Murdy Associates); Keith Benjamin (City of Charleston); Joshua Helm (Proterra); Scott Donahue (SDCOT); Sara Coello (Post & Courier); WCSC Live 5 News; WCBD News 2; Virginia Jamison (City of North Charleston); William Hamilton (Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit); Mary Neale Berkaw (CAJM); Diana Hollings; PWDDCD; Additional Interested Parties participated via virtual/conference call.

1. Call to Order

Chairman Seekings called the virtual CARTA Board of Directors Meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. followed by a moment of silence and quorum determination.

2. Consideration of Board Minutes: September 16, 2020 Meeting

***Ms. Johnson made a motion to approve the September 16, 2020 Meeting Minutes as presented.
Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

3. Financial Status Report – Robin Mitchum

Robin Mitchum, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, presented the financial status report for the period ending September 30, 2020. Ms. Mitchum noted that the agency ended the month with an excess of revenue of \$1,110,526. She reviewed the following activities for FY20 thus far:

Revenues:

- Farebox is the fares collected on the revenue vehicles.
- HOP Lot Parking Fees are the parking fees received at the HOP lot.
- City of Charleston – HOP Lot is contributions for the operations of the HOP route for 2019.
- Armad Hoffler Properties is a contract service for additional HOP route access for their residents.
- The Federal revenue includes operating and capital for the year-to-date. Federal revenue is recorded as eligible expenditures are incurred.

- Interest is interest received from the SC Department of Revenue. CARTA submits for reimbursement of the SC Fuel Excise Tax each month. SCDOR periodically pays interest earned on the funds they have held in the reimbursement process.
 - Insurance proceeds are a result of accidents.
 - Sale of Assets includes the sale of three Flexible Metro vehicles, two paratransit buses and parts.
 - Miscellaneous revenue is a fee received for a bus rental for filming, scrap metal and asset sale holding fee.
- **Expenditures:**
 - Staff Salaries & Benefits include the cost of staff time, leave, insurance, retirement and taxes.
 - Supplies include office supplies, facility maintenance supplies, disinfecting supplies and signage supplies for new vehicles.
 - Printing includes costs of printing route maps, brochures and passes.
 - Automotive costs include the maintenance on the administrative vehicle and mileage reimbursements to employees.
 - Postage is postage meter refills used to mail passes.
 - Dues/Memberships is CARTA's annual membership with the Charleston Metro Chamber of Commerce.
 - Office Equipment Rental includes the quarterly postage meter rental fee, the cost of the portable toilet rental for the HOP lot and the monthly battery lease for the electric buses.
 - Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) includes the Swiftly Transit Time & Insights Software, Cradlepoint NetCloud Essentials for mobile routers and Zscaler internet security renewal (through 9/30/2020), in addition to other IT support.
 - Rent includes the Ashley Phosphate Park & Ride lot, Dorchester Village Shopping Center Park & Ride lot, Leeds Avenue lot lease from SCE&G, SC Works Trident lease space and document storage.
 - Communications is the cost of phone, internet and radio services at both the facilities and on the buses.
 - Utilities include electric and water at the SuperStop, Melnick Park & Ride, the Radio Shop at Leeds Avenue and the charging stations at Leeds Avenue.
 - Auditing Services is the cost for CARTA's annual financial audit.
 - Custodial Services is the cost of janitorial services at the Melnick Park & Ride location and the SuperStop bus depot.
 - Other Professional Services include payroll processing system fees, new bus inspection services, UST tank inspection services, SuperStop security service and shelter repair services.
 - Shared Contract Services (IGA & Management) is the extensive services BCDCOG provides to CARTA.
 - Money Transport is the cost of the armored guard service, Brinks, to pick up and transport cash deposits to the bank.
 - Vehicle Maintenance is the cost to maintain the fleet.
 - Facility Repair & Maintenance is the cost of outside vendors to maintain facilities.
 - Operating Fees & Licenses include credit card transaction fees, stormwater fees, solid waste user fees and vehicle title and registration fees.
 - Insurance includes the cost of liability insurance provided by the Insurance Reserve Fund.
 - Interest is the interest accrued on the Melnick Park & Ride Loan.
 - Non-Capitalized Assets include the purchase of security equipment including cameras, lighting, shelter panels, radio equipment, driver and side shields on the buses, solar lighting for bus stops and two support vehicles.
 - **Capital Expenditures:**
 - Rolling Stock is the purchase of three Proterra electric buses and a Ford Starcraft Allstar.
 - Bus Facilities/Charging Stations is the purchase of six electric bus Charging Stations.

- Bus Shelter Construction/Bench Installation is the cost of four shelters.
- Security/Cameras and Equipment is the cameras on the Midi buses.

Ms. Mitchum reviewed the HOP expenditures. As of September 30, 2020, total expenditures for the HOP program for FY20 were \$601,647. She addressed questions and comments. The Board received the Financial Status Report as information.

4. FY20/21 Budget – Request for Approval – Robin Mitchum

Ms. Mitchum presented the FY20/21 Budget. She noted that all member governments, with the exception of the City of Isle of Palms, approved the proposed budget. Ms. Mitchum reviewed the budget in detail and stated that the budget will continue to be monitored to ensure revenues and expenditures remain aligned and revisions will be recommended when necessary. Ms. Mitchum then addressed questions and comments.

***Mr. Brinson made a motion to approve the FY20/21 Budget as presented.
Ms. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

5. 35' Battery Electric Bus Request for Proposals – Request for Approval – Ron Mitchum

Ron Mitchum, Executive Director, stated that the Electric Bus Selection Committee met on October 9, 2020 and reviewed four proposals for 35' Electric Buses and associated equipment. Proposals were received from BYD, Gillig, New Flyer and Proterra, Inc. The Selection Committee recommends that CARTA award a contract to Proterra, Inc. based on the overall score sheet rankings. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

***Mr. Green made a motion to approve the 35' Battery Electric Bus Request for Proposal as presented.
Mr. Lewis seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

Chairman Seekings noted that Proterra is located in Greenville, South Carolina and that the agency is pleased to do business with an in-state company. Proterra's Greenville facility has the highest vehicle manufacturing standards in the industry.

6. Armored Car Transport Services Contract Renewal – Request for Proposal – Ron Mitchum

Mr. Mitchum presented the Armored Car Transport Services Contract Renewal. He stated that CARTA requests approval to amend the Brink's Incorporated-Armored Transport Services contract for an additional year pursuant to the renewal terms outlined in the contract. The contract was awarded on November 5, 2019 as a one-year contract with two options to annually renew. This amendment would extend the contract through November 4, 2021. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

***Ms. Johnson made a motion to approve the Armored Car Transport Services Contract
Request for Proposal as presented.
Mr. Lewis seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

7. Transit Asset Management Plan Annual Report – Jeff Burns

Ms. Mitchum presented the Transit Asset Management Plan Annual Report on Mr. Burns' behalf. She noted that the Federal Transit Administration's Transit Asset Management Plan (FTA TAM Plan) requirement mandates that transit agencies establish a strategic and systematic process of operating, maintaining and improving public transportation capital assets effectively through their entire life cycle. It requires FTA grantees to develop asset management plans for their public transportation assets, including vehicles, facilities, equipment and other infrastructure and report annually on progress toward achieving the performance targets. Ms. Mitchum explained that CARTA established the goal of achieving and maintaining a state of good repair for its public transit assets. Transit asset management is a

business model that uses transit asset condition to guide the optimal prioritization of funding. The FTA has defined State of Good Repair (SGR) as the condition in which a capital asset is able to operate at a full level of performance. A capital asset is in a state of good repair when that asset (1) is able to perform its designed function, (2) does not pose a known unacceptable safety risk, and (3) its lifecycle investments must have been met or recovered. CARTA established performance measure targets for fiscal year 2020 and will operate under the same targets in fiscal year 2021. During the fiscal year, CARTA continued implementation of its vehicle replacement program which resulted in the average age of the revenue fleet to decrease by 12%. There were six new vehicles introduced into the fleet with a like number of vehicles retired. The revenue fleet, in terms of average age, declined by 1.1 years from 9.1 years to 8.0 years and the average mileage on the revenue fleet increase slightly from 313,839 miles to 315,990 over the fiscal year. The portion of the fleet that had the most significant decline in average age is the cutaway bus sub-fleet, which declined from an average of 3.7 years to 2.4. The condition of the equipment in each asset classification has maintained an adequate or greater rating except for the shop equipment category. The replacement of assets has contributed to this acceptance condition, in addition to a quality maintenance plan. As indicated by the progress toward achieving the performance targets, CARTA has made significant progress. In particular, the accomplishment to move from 36% of the revenue fleet at or exceeding their Useful Life Benchmark (ULB) to 27% is considerable advancement toward the goal. The equipment category is skewed by two pieces of equipment that are 34 years old each. Both pieces of equipment continue to perform their function safely and effectively and do not necessitate replacement, especially with the limited use they receive. During the next fiscal year, this replacement process will continue. There are three battery-electric buses scheduled for delivery in March 2021 and six more battery-electric buses entering the pre-production process with delivery anticipated in late 2021. Further, there is an additional 19 battery-electric buses moving through the procurement process that will continue to produce progress toward achieving the performance targets. Ms. Mitchum noted that CARTA is responsible for collecting and maintaining ongoing operational data needed for studies and the MPO's Public Transportation Management System. This information will be shared with the CHATS MPO to facilitate their performance-based planning process and to integrate these performance targets into their planning documents, including the annual listing of obligated projects. She stated that staff will continue to work toward maintaining a State of Good Repair with the goal of exceeding the performance measures established in the TAM Plan. Significant progress has been made and that will continue in the next fiscal year. Ms. Mitchum addressed questions and comments. The Board received the Transit Asset Management Plan Annual Report as information.

8. Student Fare Pilot – Fare Equity Analysis – Request for Approval – Jon Dodson

Jon Dodson, Planner II, presented the Student Fare Pilot – Fare Equity Analysis. He noted that an analysis of the fare revision was conducted in accordance with the FTA's Title VI guidelines. The Title VI Policy requires that transit agencies review proposals to ensure that their impact is not "disproportionate" or "disparate" on minority and low-income riders. The Agency must then implement the least impactful alternative and mitigate any impacts should a negative impact be determined. Mr. Dodson stated that CARTA is considering a permanent fare decrease which would eliminate student fares for those in kindergarten through the 12th grade. This fare change was originally implemented in April 2019 as part of a pilot project that was then extended for additional review in the fall of 2019. All of the other fare media and current pricing would remain in effect. It is concluded that eliminating fares for students under 18 will benefit minority and low-income riders. He explained that this action had no impact on the cost of paratransit at \$4.00 for all trips. This is consistent with the Department of Transportation (DOT) Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) regulations that require paratransit fares to be comparable to the fare for a trip between the same points on the regular fixed route transit system. "Comparable" is defined in DOT ADA regulations as not more than twice the regular fare that would be charged to an individual paying full fare for a trip. The analyses of the fare change proposal indicate that adverse effects are unlikely because the fare proposal will not result in an increase in fares nor will it result in the consolidation or removal of any services or fare options. Thus, the fare change proposals do not have

any disparate impacts to minority riders nor do they place disproportionate burden on low-income riders. This is a net positive for transit patrons throughout the System. Mr. Dodson stated that staff recommends approval of the Title VI Report and approval to implement the proposed fare structure modification and addressed questions and comments.

***Ms. Johnson made a motion to approve the Student Fare Pilot – Fare Equity Analysis as presented.
Mr. Lewis seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

Chairman Seekings thanked the Board for their support and commended Mr. Mitchum and staff for implementing the program.

9. Lowcountry Rapid Transit Project Update – Ron Mitchum

Mr. Mitchum noted that progress continues with meeting the September 2021 deadline for submission to the FTA. We will not receive any deadline extensions due to the pandemic, however, we continue to navigate around those issues with virtual meetings, etc. He stated that now that we have the preferred alignment, we will start moving into the operational plans with SCDOT and Charleston County. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments. The Board received the Lowcountry Rapid Transit Project update as information.

10. Election Day Service to Polls – Request for Approval – Ron Mitchum

Mr. Mitchum stated that CARTA would like to offer fare-free service on all of its routes on Election Day, which is Tuesday, November 3, 2020. He addressed questions and comments. Following discussion, it was decided that from October 22 until November 2, 2020, riders who presented an “I Voted” sticker upon boarding will receive a fare-free ride to their next destination. Chairman Seekings noted that, going forward, Election Day Service to the Polls will be included as part of Policy for general election days.

***Mayor O’Neil made a motion to approve the Election Day Service to Polls as amended.
Mr. Lewis seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

11. Isle of Palms Beach Shuttle Service Update – Ron Mitchum

Mr. Mitchum delivered an update on the Isle of Palms Beach Shuttle Service. He stated that the pilot service from Mt. Pleasant to the Isle of Palms during the last few weekends had 15 riders total. Staff will work further on improving the service if it is decided to resume the service in 2021. Adjustments will be needed on parking capability, the type of vehicle used for the shuttle and limitations on bags, beach gear, etc. Councilmember Ward noted that he has made an agreement with a beach equipment rental service on the Island. The service will allow riders to rent chairs, umbrellas, etc. in advance and the equipment will be flagged with the rider’s name and will be ready and waiting on them upon their arrival to the beach. Mr. Mitchum stated that a plan will be brought to the Board in the beginning of 2021 to allow adequate time to make the necessary adjustments in order for the service to be successful. Mayor Tecklenburg recommended that a shuttle service to Folly Beach be looked into as well. Ms. Johnson noted that she supported a shuttle service to Folly Beach several years ago and recalled an issue of there not being an appropriate place for the bus to turn around. She supports looking into shuttle service to Folly Beach going forward. Mr. Mitchum noted that staff will re-visit the service to Folly Beach. He then addressed questions and comments. The Board received the update as information.

12. Executive Director’s Report – Ron Mitchum

In the interest of time, Mr. Mitchum noted that status reports regarding the following matters were included in the agenda packet for the Board’s information.

- Bus Stop Solar Lighting Project
- Bus Stop Improvement Program
- Vanpool Program

- TNC Project
- Leeds Avenue Parking Lot Expansion
- Digital Signage
- ITS Project
- Shipwatch Square Transit Center
- HOP Lot

He stated that the ridership update is also included. He encouraged Board members to contact him if they had any questions or comments regarding the status reports and the ridership update.

13. Other Business, If Any

There was no other business to discuss.

14. Public Comments, If Any

There were two public comments:

- Virginia Jamison, City of North Charleston Councilmember, expressed her concerns regarding the Greenridge Road corridor. She apologized for any confusion and requested a letter of explanation so that she may share the details with her constituents.
- William Hamilton, Executive Director of Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, expressed his concerns regarding the service being connected to Highway 40 and having bus stop benches on the Isle of Palms. He also thanked the Board for their approval of the Isle of Palms beach shuttle service pilot and commended CARTA for being in compliance regarding sanitation, PPEs and social distancing during the pandemic.

15. Board Comments, If Any

- Chairman Seekings noted that CARTA was the first public transit agency to mandate wearing masks during the pandemic. He commended Mr. Mitchum, Mr. Bonner and staff for being attentive and responsive to the needs of the community and in keeping everyone safe. He thanked everyone for their participation in the virtual Board Meeting and commended the staff for their hard work. He thanked Board Members for their service to the agency and the community.

16. Adjourn

There being no further business before the Board, Chairman Seekings adjourned the meeting at 2:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Kim Coleman