

CHARLESTON AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
February 19, 2020

The Charleston Area Regional Transportation Authority (CARTA) Board of Directors met on Wednesday, February 19, 2020, at the Berkeley-Charleston-Dorchester Council of Governments located at 5790 Casper Padgett Way in North Charleston, South Carolina.

MEMBERSHIP: Ed Astle; Mary Beth Berry; Ron Brinson; Brenda Corley; Dwayne Green; Alfred Harrison; Will Haynie; Anna Johnson; Pat O'Neil; Christie Rainwater; Vic Rawl; Michael Seekings; Elliott Summey; Keith Summey; John Tecklenburg; Jimmy Ward; Craig Weaver

MEMBERSHIP PRESENT: Ed Astle; Mary Beth Berry; Ron Brinson; Anna Johnson; Michael Seekings

PROXIES: Dennis Turner for Christie Rainwater; Jerry Lahm for Elliott Summey; Ray Anderson for Keith Summey; Lynn Christian for Alfred Harrison; Keith Benjamin for John Tecklenburg; Stephanie Tillerson for Craig Weaver

STAFF PRESENT: Ron Mitchum; Andrea Kozloski; Robin Mitchum; Michelle Emerson; Sharon Hollis; Jon Dodson; John Lambert; Daniel Brock; Kim Coleman

OTHERS PRESENT: David Bonner (Transdev); Alisha Wigfall (Transdev); Megan Madden (Transdev); Harry Burnell (Transdev); Karen Campbell (Transdev); Kristen Carter (Transdev); Ashanti Brown (Transdev); Robert Milhous (Robert E. Milhous, CPA); Marquel Coaxum (Rawle-Murdy Associates); Renee Miller-Cotton (SCDOT-OPT); Charles Drayton (City of North Charleston); Patrick Hoff (Charleston Regional Business Journal); Marsha Johnson (Women Helping other Women, Inc.); KJ Kearney (Conservation Voters of South Carolina); Julie Lawrence (RSFH); Tara Tsehlane (RSFH); Phil Jos (CAJM); Lisa Ross (CAJM); Mary Neale Berkaw (CAJM); Sue Johnson (CAJM); Skip Johnson (CAJM); Rose Stump (CAJM); Tom Robinson (CAJM); Michael Gates (CAJM); William Hamilton (Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit); Julia Hamilton (Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit)

1. Call to Order

Chairman Seekings called the CARTA Board of Directors Meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. followed by a moment of silence. Chairman Seekings introduced David Bonner, Transdev General Manager. Mr. Bonner announced that Harry Burnell was retiring after 50 years of service and introduced Mr. Burnell to the Board of Directors and meeting attendees. Mr. Burnell was recognized and thanked for his many years of service to the agency and the community.

2. Consideration of Board Minutes: January 15, 2020 Meeting

Mr. Lahm made a motion to approve the January 15, 2020 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Mr. Astle seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

3. FY19 Audit Presentation – Robert E. Milhous, CPA

Robert Milhous, of Robert E. Milhous, CPA, PA & Associates, presented the FY19 Audit Report. Mr. Milhous reviewed the Audit Report by the respective sections: Basic Financial Statements, Required Supplementary Information and Supplementary Federal Financial Assistance Reports. He reviewed the Statement of Net Position as of September 30, 2019 in detail. He also reviewed the Statement of Revenue, Expenses and Changes in Fund Net Position and the Statement of Cash Flows. Mr. Milhous noted that the audit was good overall and the agency remains compliant with Federal Accounting Standards. Mr. Milhous addressed questions and comments.

Mr. Brinson made a motion to approve the FY19 Audit Report as presented.

Ms. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

4. Financial Status Report – Robin Mitchum

Robin Mitchum, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, presented the financial status report for the period ending January 31, 2020. Ms. Mitchum noted that the agency ended the month with an excess of revenue of \$1,326,858 and reviewed the following activities for FY20 thus far:

- **Revenues:**
 - Farebox is the fares collected on the revenue vehicles.
 - HOP Lot Parking Fees are the parking fees received at the HOP lot.
 - City of Charleston – HOP Lot is contributions for the operations of the HOP route for 2019.
 - The Federal revenue includes operating and capital for the year-to-date. Federal revenue is recorded as eligible expenditures are incurred.
 - Interest is interest received from the SC Department of Revenue. CARTA submits for reimbursement of the SC Fuel Excise Tax each month. SCDOR periodically pays interest earned on the funds they have held in the reimbursement process.
 - Insurance proceeds are a result of accidents.
 - Sale of Assets includes the sale of two Flexible Metro vehicles.

- **Expenditures:**
 - Staff Salaries & Benefits includes the cost of staff time, leave, insurance, retirement and taxes.
 - Supplies include office supplies and facility maintenance supplies.
 - Printing includes costs of printing route maps, brochures and passes.
 - Automotive costs include the maintenance on the administrative vehicle and mileage reimbursements to employees. In October, the 2013 Ford Explorer required a new battery.
 - Dues/Memberships is CARTA's annual membership with the Charleston Metro Chamber of Commerce.
 - Office Equipment Rental includes the quarterly postage meter rental fee and the cost of the portable toilet rental for the HOP lot.
 - Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) includes the FY20 portion of the Swiftly Transit Time & Insights Software (through 6/28/2020), FY20 portion of the Cradlepoint NetCloud Essentials for mobile routers and Zscaler internet security renewal (through 9/30/2020), in addition to other IT support. This is the bulk of the FY20 expenditure for the Transit Time & Insights and the Cradlepoint software maintenance.
 - Rent includes the Ashley Phosphate Park & Ride lot, Leeds Avenue lot lease from SCE&G, SC Works Trident lease space and document storage.
 - Communications is the cost of phone, internet and radio services at both the facilities and on the buses.
 - Utilities include electric and water at the SuperStop, Melnick Park & Ride, the Radio Shop at Leeds Avenue and the charging stations at Leeds Avenue.
 - Custodial Services is the cost of janitorial services at the Melnick Park & Ride location.
 - Other Professional Services include payroll processing system fees, new bus inspection services and shelter repair services.
 - Shared Contract Services (IGA & Management) is the extensive services BCDCOG provides to CARTA.
 - Money Transport is the cost of the armored guard service, Brinks, to pick up and transport cash deposits to the bank.
 - Vehicle Maintenance is the cost to maintain the fleet.
 - Facility Repair & Maintenance is the cost of outside vendors to maintain facilities. CARTA repaired the hardscape pavers at the SuperStop and purchased panels to repair bus shelters.
 - Operating Fees & Licenses include credit card transaction fees, stormwater fees, solid waste user fees and vehicle title and registration fees.
 - Insurance includes the cost of liability insurance provided by the Insurance Reserve Fund. The amount will increase and decrease throughout the year as we add and remove items on the policy. The amount shown is the FY20 portion of the 2019 and 2020 policy period. This is the bulk of the expenditure for the year. Many shelters, vehicles and the addition of the Melnick Park & Ride have been added to the policy.
 - Interest is the interest accrued on the Melnick Park & Ride Loan.
 - Non-Capitalized Assets include the purchase of security equipment including cameras, lighting and radio equipment.

- **Capital Expenditures:**

- Rolling Stock is the purchase of three Proterra electric buses.
- Bus Facilities/Charging Stations is the purchase of three electric bus Charging Stations.

Ms. Mitchum reviewed the HOP expenditures. As of January 31, 2020, total expenditures for the HOP program for FY20 were \$285,241. She also noted that the agency received \$250 thousand from the City of Charleston for the HOP Lot that was not expected. Ms. Mitchum addressed questions and comments. The Board received the Financial Status Report as information.

5. Accounting Policies & Procedures Revision – Request for Approval – Robin Mitchum

Ms. Mitchum presented the revised Accounting Policies & Procedures based on the final report from the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) for their Financial Management Oversight (FMO) Follow-Up Review performed in September of 2019. She noted the corrections to the Farebox Revenue section of the Accounting Policies & Procedures and one addition to the Farebox Revenue section. Ms. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

***Mr. Astle made a motion to approve the Accounting Policies & Procedures Revisions as presented.
Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

6. Electric Bus RFP – Request for Approval

Ron Mitchum, Executive Director, stated that the 40ft. Electric Bus Selection Committee met on February 14, 2020 and reviewed four proposals for the Electric Bus RFP. Proposals were received from BYD, Gillig, New Flyer of America and Proterra. Mr. Mitchum explained that, based on the overall scoresheet rankings, the Selection Committee recommend that the agency award a contract to New Flyer of America. The base order will be for six vehicles, six depot charging stations and one on-route charging station. The contract will allow the option to purchase up to 25 additional vehicles and associated infrastructure for a period of five years. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

***Ms. Johnson made a motion to approve the Electric Bus RFP as presented.
Mr. Astle seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

7. Lease Agreement with Dominion Energy – Request for Approval

Mr. Mitchum noted that, in an effort to obtain additional space at the Leeds Avenue facility, discussions are being held with Dominion Energy about the agency acquiring additional property from them to aid in the conversion of the fleet to electric. Mr. Mitchum presented slides depicting the parcel of land that would be in addition to what the agency currently leases from Dominion Energy. CARTA currently leases a parcel of land for \$500.00 per month. As a result of discussions, Dominion Energy has offered to lease both parcels to CARTA for \$500.00 per month for a period of five years and then month-to-month thereafter. Mr. Mitchum noted that CARTA had hoped to purchase the parcels of land but it is believed that leasing would be beneficial to the agency; therefore, approval is requested to execute the lease agreement and continue with efforts to ultimately purchase the property. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

***Mr. Anderson made a motion to approve the Lease Agreement with Dominion Energy as presented.
Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

8. Property Acquisition – Shipwatch Square – Request for Approval

Mr. Mitchum noted that staff has been working with Charleston County staff on the development of a new transit center at Shipwatch Square to replace the existing SuperStop. The Center would be a significant improvement over the existing location and would serve the Library as well as the proposed County Human Services facility. Mr. Mitchum stated that, in addition, it would connect to the proposed LCRT station which would serve the area. The City of North Charleston has indicated that they would also locate an expanded Police Sub-Station at the facility. Mr. Mitchum requested authorization from the Board of Directors to move forward with the acquisition process for the property needed to facilitate the development of the Library, Police Sub-Station and the Transit Center. Charleston County has obtained the services of a firm to master plan the site and the BCDCOG's consultants are working with

this team to ensure the facility would be functional and appropriately sized. In addition, Charleston County has offered to provide staff to facilitate the acquisition of the needed parcels. Mr. Mitchum explained that since this is the early stage of the acquisition process, the actual cost of the parcels is not yet known. Once the costs are known, Board approval of the purchase price will be requested prior to moving forward with the acquisition. Mr. Mitchum addressed questions and comments.

Mr. Brinson made a motion to authorize Executive Director Mitchum to move forward with the appropriate steps leading up to the Property Acquisition of Shipwatch Square for purposes discussed. Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

9. Peninsula Transportation Network Company (TNC) Pilot – Service Change Recommendations – Request for Approval – Jon Dodson

Jon Dodson, Planner II, presented the Transportation Network Company Pilot for the Peninsula. He explained that the program would serve seniors (55+) and qualified Tel-A-Ride clients Monday through Friday between 9am and 5pm. The subsidized trips within the Peninsula would connect riders to or from the Medical District. Mr. Dodson noted that the pilot would be funded through a grant and the elimination of Route 204. Currently, Route 204 cost \$41 per passenger and is the least productive route in the system. Tel-A-Ride is \$30 per trip. The subsidy would be \$5 per trip and up to 20 trips per month for riders and there is no cap for Tel-A-Ride clients. Mr. Dodson addressed questions and comments.

Mr. Brinson made a motion to authorize Executive Director Mitchum to move forward with Procurement with Best Practices built in the Contract(s) for the Pilot Program. Mr. Astle seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

10. Route 104 Community Petition – Discussion

Sharon Hollis, Principal Planner, discussed the Route 104 Community Petition for a re-route. She presented slides depicting the current route and noted that it is stated that no buses would operate along Gaynor Avenue. Ms. Hollis explained that the community requests to reinstate service to Montague Avenue and serve the Transit Center with Route 10. She explained that the transit system is unable to reliably service both Montague Avenue and the Transit Center without using Gaynor Avenue and that changing Route 104 service to Gaynor Avenue may require City of North Charleston, FTA and Community agreements. Ms. Hollis addressed questions and comments. The discussion was received as information.

11. Mt. Pleasant Transit Study – Update – Sharon Hollis

The Mt. Pleasant Transit Study update was deferred to the next Board of Directors meeting when Mayor Haynie would be present.

12. Marketing/Outreach Report – Michelle Emerson

Michelle Emerson, Marketing and Communications Manager, presented the Marketing/Outreach Report. She updated the Board on the App statistics for January 2020 as well as Social Media impressions, engagements and link clicks. Ms. Emerson also highlighted the Million-Mile Drivers: Larry Jenkins; Mike Lavigne; Tiffany Ancrum as well as the Electric Bus Service Launch that was held at Leeds Avenue on February 4th. She also discussed upcoming events such as “Seniors Ride Free Day,” the hospitality fair, the Black Expo and the MUSC Expo, as well as additional airport outreach. Ms. Emerson addressed questions and comments. The Board received the Marketing/Outreach Report as information.

13. Executive Director’s Report

In the interest of time, Mr. Mitchum referred to the Monthly Performance Snapshot for January 2020 that was distributed prior to the Board Meeting.

14. Other Business, If Any

There was no other business to discuss.

15. Public Comments, If Any

There were three public comments:

- Phil Jos, with CAJM, explained CAJM's intent and stated they are dedicated advocates for public transit and additional funding for public transit. Mr. Jos inquired about CARTA's plan and timetable to increase service on particular routes.
- William Hamilton, Executive Director of Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, discussed an article that was featured in today's Charleston City Paper regarding Charleston civil rights hero and transportation advocate, Mr. Esau Jenkins. Mr. Hamilton also expressed his concerns regarding the Lowline. He also discussed an upcoming rally which will be held across the street from the SuperStop.
- Marsha Johnson, with Women Helping other Women, Inc., expressed her concerns regarding Tel-A-Ride customer complaints.

16. Board Comments, If Any

- Ms. Tillerson requested an update on safety information regarding the Greenridge Road route.

17. Adjourn

There being no further business before the Board, Chairman Seekings adjourned the meeting at 2:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Kim Coleman