

CHARLESTON AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
June 19, 2019

The Charleston Area Regional Transportation Authority (CARTA) Board of Directors met on Wednesday, June 19, 2019, at the Berkeley-Charleston-Dorchester Council of Governments located at 5790 Casper Padgett Way in North Charleston, South Carolina.

MEMBERSHIP: Ed Astle; Mary Beth Berry; Bob Brimmer; Dwayne Green; Alfred Harrison; Virginia Jamison; Anna Johnson; James Lewis; Pat O'Neil; Jim Owens; Christie Rainwater; Vic Rawl; Michael Seekings; Elliott Summey; Keith Summey; John Tecklenburg; Jimmy Ward; Craig Weaver

MEMBERSHIP PRESENT: Ed Astle; Mary Beth Berry; Dwayne Green; Virginia Jamison; Anna Johnson; James Lewis; Jim Owens; Michael Seekings; John Tecklenburg

PROXIES: Dennis Turner for Christie Rainwater; Jerry Lahm for Elliott Summey; Ray Anderson for Keith Summey; Lynn Christian for Alfred Harrison

STAFF PRESENT: Ron Mitchum; Andrea Kozloski; Robin Mitchum; Heater Brady; Jeff Burns; Sharon Hollis; Michelle Emerson; Kim Coleman

OTHERS PRESENT: David Bonner (Transdev); Daniel Brock (Rawle-Murdy Associates); Marquel Coaxum (Rawle-Murdy Associates); Raegan Loftis (Rawle-Murdy Associates); William Hamilton (public); Julia Hamilton (public); Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit Interns (public)

1. Call to Order

Chairman Seekings called the CARTA Board of Directors Meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. followed by a moment of silence.

2. Consideration of Board Minutes: May 15, 2019 Meeting

Mr. Owens made a motion to approve the May 15, 2019 Meeting Minutes as presented and Mr. Astle seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

3. Financial Status Report – Robin Mitchum

Robin Mitchum, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, presented the financial status report for the period ending May 31, 2019. Ms. Mitchum noted that the agency ended the month with an excess of revenue of \$411,363.

- The budget to actual revenues for the month was mostly on target with projections:
 - Community Pride is the remaining balance in the project from Palmetto Pride for the annual statewide clean-up initiative.
 - The Federal revenue includes operating and capital for the year-to-date.
 - The State Mass Transit Funds revenue is the funds available and expended as match to the Federal 5307 funds and capital funds to purchase 4 2019 Champion LF Transport E450s.
 - HOP lot revenue includes the Charleston Area Convention and Visitors Bureau and the City of Charleston contributions towards the operation of the HOP route. This is their contributions from October through December 2018.
 - Capital Revenue is local private capital contributions towards bench or shelter preparation and construction sites. The current amount is a contribution towards shelter construction at the Roper Hospital location.

- Insurance proceeds are a result of accidents.
 - Sales of Assets include the sale of 5 Trolleys, 4 Cutaways and 16 Flexible Metros.
 - Miscellaneous revenue is a fee received from a motion picture company for use of a bus for a commercial.
- The budget to actual expenditures for the month was mostly on target with projections:
 - Printing includes costs of printing route maps, brochures and passes.
 - Marketing includes costs associated with promoting the transit system. This includes the promotional supplies from the Community Pride Project which was part of the Great American Clean-Up project in our region.
 - Automotive costs include both parking expenses and mileage reimbursements to employees.
 - Accounting (Auditing) is the cost for CARTA's annual financial audit.
 - Dues/Memberships is CARTA's annual membership with the Charleston Metro Chamber of Commerce.
 - Office Equipment Rental includes the quarterly postage meter rental fee and the cost of the portable toilet rental for the HOP lot.
 - Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) includes the FY19 portion of the Swiftly Transit Time & Insights Software renewal (through 6/28/19), the FY19 portion of the NetCloud Essentials for mobile routers and Zscaler internet security renewal (through 7/24/19) in addition to other IT support. This is the bulk of the FY19 expenditure for the Transit Time & Insights software maintenance.
 - Rent includes the Ashley Phosphate Park & Ride lot, Leeds Avenue lot lease from SCE&G, SC Works Trident lease space and document storage.
 - Money Counting is the cost of the armored guard service, GARDA, to pick-up and transport cash deposits to the bank.
 - Professional Services include legal fees, audit fees, payroll processing system fees and the cost of the security guard for the HOP lot.
 - Contract Services (IGA & Management) is the extensive services the BCDCOG provides to CARTA.
 - Shelter/Bench Contract Services is engineering services provided through the IGA with BCDCOG for the Shelter/Bench Projects.
 - Melnick Property Contract Services is engineering services provided through the IGA with BCDCOG for the Melnick Property.
 - Vehicle Maintenance is the cost to maintain the fleet.
 - Operating Fees & Licenses include credit card transaction fees and vehicle title and registration fees.
 - Insurance includes the cost of liability insurance provided by the Insurance Reserve Fund. The amount will increase and decrease throughout the year as we add and remove items on the policy, but the amount shown is the bulk of the expenditure for the year.
 - Rolling Stock is the purchase of the 2018 Ford Starcraft Allstar cutaway, 2 2019 Ford Starcraft Allstar Cutaways, the 2018 Eldorado Amerivan, 16 Gillig buses, 4 2019 Champion LF Transport E450s and 1 2013 Alexander Dennis Enviro 200.
 - Bus Shelter Construction/Bench Installation is the cost to purchase and install shelters and benches.
 - Security Cameras & Equipment is the cost to purchase security cameras and security equipment for CARTA's buses and facilities.
 - Capital includes funds for Facility Maintenance, signage and other capital assets related to the operation of the transit system.

Ms. Mitchum also reviewed the HOP expenditures. As of May 31, 2019, total expenditures for the HOP program were \$643,511. The Board received the Financial Status Report as information.

4. FY20 Proposed Budget – Request for Approval – Robin Mitchum

Ms. Mitchum presented the FY20 Proposed Budget. She reviewed the budget in detail, noting the following explanation of line item changes:

Revenues

- Federal revenue includes estimated 5307 Urban funds, 5310 Enhanced Mobility for Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities and 5339 funds to purchase buses. CARTA receives funds as a direct recipient from FTA and Pass Through funds from the BCDCOG.
- State Mass Transit Funds is operating funds and capital funds to match federal funds for the purchase of buses and charging stations.

Expenditures

- Staff salaries and benefits increase reflects the increase in employer contributions for retirement and insurance benefits as they relate to wages.
- Marketing is decreased by the Community Pride project from the prior fiscal year.
- Automotive is decreased by the City of Charleston parking lot fees.
- Postage is decreased to align the budget with average expenditures.
- Equipment Rental is decreased by the removal of the HOP Lot portable toilet.
- Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) includes IT services (managed server services, email hosting, website management and other general IT services), camera system maintenance and AVL software maintenance. The annual software was discounted for the first year and will increase this fiscal year.
- Rent is decreased to align the budget with average expenditures for document storage fees.
- Communication is decreased by the removal of the HOP Lot internet service. Additionally, the slight increase is for the monthly digital radio frequency cost which is a per radio fee.
- Utilities is decreased by the removal of the electricity for the HOP Lot but includes a slight increase for electricity for the charging stations.
- Advertising is decreased. The majority of marketing services are provided by BCDCOG staff and Rawle-Murdy Associates and the cost is passed from the BCDCOG to CARTA under the intergovernmental agreement.
- Professional Services is mostly decreased by the removal of the HOP Lot Security Guard.
- Contract Services is decreased by the conclusion of the Melnick Property Engineering project, Shelter/Bench Engineering project and the HOP Lot Low Line Engineering project.
- Vehicle Maintenance is decreased to align the budget with average anticipated expenditures.
- Insurance is increased based on the Insurance Reserve Fund's projected increases across their services.
- Fuel has increased to align with average expenditures.
- Fixed Route has been increased based on estimated services provided by Transdev. The hourly rate increases 3% on July 1st.
- Paratransit has been increased based on estimated services provided by Transdev. The hourly rate increases 3% on July 1st.
- Interest is the interest accrued on the Melnick Property loan.
- Rolling Stock is being reduced to the amount of rolling stock CARTA anticipates receiving in this fiscal year.
- Bus Facilities/Charging Stations is for the purchase of charging stations for electric buses.
- Security Cameras and Equipment are funds available to purchase security equipment at facilities and on rolling stock.
- Capital includes funds for Facility Maintenance, signage and other capital assets related to the operation of the transit system.

Ms. Mitchum noted that the budget will continue to be monitored to ensure revenues and expenditures remain aligned and recommended revisions will be made as needed.

Ms. Johnson made a motion to approve the FY20 Proposed Budget as presented and Mr. Lewis seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

5. FY20-FY22 DBE Usage Goal – Request for Approval – Jeff Burns

Jeff Burns, Grants & Contracts Compliance Administrator, presented the Annual Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Usage Goal for Fiscal Years 2020, 2021 and 2022. Mr. Burns explained that the purpose of the process is to

determine the overall goal for usage of DBEs in FTA-funded contracts and projects during Federal Fiscal Years 2020-2022 as a condition of receiving this assistance. It is CARTA's policy to ensure that DBEs, as defined in 49 CFR Part 26, have an equal opportunity to receive and participate in DOT-assisted contracts. Further, it is CARTA's policy: to create a level playing field on which DBEs can compete fairly for DOT-assisted contracts; to assist the development of firms that can compete successfully in the market place outside the DBE program; and to facilitate competition in DOT-assisted public works projects by small business concerns, both DBEs and non-DBE small businesses. Mr. Burns also reviewed Step 1 – to establish the number of willing, ready and able (RWA) DBE firms relative to the number of businesses RWA to perform work for the FTA-funded projects undertaken by CARTA and Step 2 – to apply a weighted average to the value established in Step 1 based on the availability of DBE firms and the anticipated contract amount of services or products provided. Mr. Burns explained that CARTA staff strives to involve DBEs in every contract and will continue to build and maintain relationships to facilitate the development of disadvantaged businesses and individuals. CARTA will work to meet the USDOT aspirational goal of 10% beyond the goal established using the goal-setting methodology prescribed by the FTA. Mr. Burns then addressed questions and comments.

Chief Turner made a motion to approve the FY20-22 DBE Usage Goal as presented and Mr. Astle seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

6. Swiftly Contract Renewal – Request for Approval

Ron Mitchum, Executive Director, noted that CARTA is requesting approval to amend the Swiftly, Inc. – Real Time Location Services contract for an additional year pursuant to the terms outlined in the contract. Swiftly, Inc. will deliver all services in accordance with CARTA's requirements for \$105,000,000 a year. Modules include On-Time Performance, GPS Playback, Vehicle Speed and Runtime. The contract was awarded on June 29, 2017 as a one-year contract with four options to renew annually. This amendment will extend the contract from June 29, 2019 through June 28, 2020.

Mr. Astle made a motion to approve the Swiftly Contract Renewal as presented and Mr. Owens seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

7. LoNo Discretionary Grant Sub-Recipient Agreement – Request for Approval

Mr. Mitchum noted that CARTA is the sub-recipient of \$1,500,000 in federal funds to purchase 3 electric buses and 3 charging stations through a LoNo Discretionary grant awarded to the BCDCOG. The award requires CARTA to provide 20% matching funds of \$375,000. Mr. Mitchum requested authorization for CARTA to execute the sub-recipient agreement with the BCDCOG to purchase these vehicles and provide the required match.

Mr. Lewis made a motion to approve the LoNo Discretionary Grant Sub-Recipient Agreement as presented and Mr. Astle seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

8. Bus Fare Policy Revisions – Request for Approval:

A) Fare Policy

B) Transfers Policy

Mr. Mitchum stated that an analysis of the fare revisions was conducted in accordance with the FTA's Title VI guidelines. The Title VI Policy requires that transit agencies review proposals to ensure that their impact is not "disproportionate" or "disparate" on minority and low-income riders. The agency must then implement the least impactful alternative and mitigate any impacts should a negative impact be determined. CARTA is considering a fare decrease to multiple fare classes to be implemented on July 1, 2019. The proposal entails the elimination of a transfer fare, the expansion of the senior fare to all operating hours and the introduction of a weekly unlimited ride, local route pass and a weekly unlimited ride, express route pass. All of the other fare media and current pricing will remain in effect. It is concluded that reducing the cost of the transfer fare, introduction of a weekly, unlimited ride pass will benefit minority and low-income riders. The elimination of the transfer fare will especially help minority and low-income individuals. Low-income individuals will still be eligible for the reduced fare, if they choose to pay on a per-trip basis, which provides access to one route-to-route transfer. This action will also reduce the cost of trip on CARTA's Tel-A-Ride service to \$4.00 for all trips. This is consistent with the DOT's Americans with Disabilities Act

(ADA) regulations that require para-transit fares to be comparable to the fare for a trip between the same points on the regular fixed-route transit system. The weekly pass offers a lower cost entry point and effectively caps the cost for travel during the week. The composition of the rider group that is positively affected by the fare change is the same proportion of minority and low-income riders as the composition of CARTA riders overall. Thus, the fare change proposals do not have any disparate impacts to minority riders nor do they place disproportionate burden on low-income riders. This is a net positive for transit patrons throughout the system. Mr. Mitchum then addresses questions and comments.

Ms. Johnson made a motion to approve the Bus Fare Policy Revisions as presented and Mr. Green seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

9. Resolutions of Support – Request for Approval:

A) BUILD Grant Application

Mr. Mitchum presented a Resolution in support of the BCDCOG’s BUILD Grant Application. Upon approval of the Board of Directors, the Resolution states that the CARTA Board of Directors fully supports the BCDCOG’s effort to modernize CARTA’s fleet and supports funding the BUILD Grant application.

B) Bus and Bus Facilities Grant Application

Mr. Mitchum presented a Resolution in support of the BCDCOG’s FY2019 Grants for Bus and Bus Facilities Program Application. Upon approval of the Board of Directors, the Resolution states that the CARTA Board of Directors fully supports the BCDCOG’s effort to modernize CARTA’s fleet with zero-emission, all-electric transit buses and supports funding the BUILD Grant application.

Mr. Astle made a motion to approve the Resolutions of Support as presented and Mr. Anderson seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

10. Marketing/Outreach Report – Daniel Brock

Daniel Brock, with Rawle-Murdy Associates, presented the Marketing/Outreach Report. He updated the Board on the App statistics for the last four weeks as well as Social Media engagements and link clicks. Mr. Brock also highlighted public outreach promotions and events as well as the upcoming Dump the Pump Day and LCRT Open House & Online meetings. The Board received the Marketing/Outreach Report as information.

11. Executive Director’s Report

Mr. Mitchum presented slides depicting the progress of the construction at the Rivers Avenue Park & Ride facility. He stated that a Ribbon-Cutting ceremony will be planned for the beginning of August. Mr. Mitchum also discussed the slides depicting the Intermodal Center. The City of North Charleston will announce the date of a Ribbon-Cutting ceremony for the Intermodal Center. In addition, reports were distributed prior to the start of the meeting which included ridership summary statistics, the monthly performance snapshot, upcoming events and activities. Mr. Mitchum noted that ridership is up; however, on-time performance time was down slightly (primarily due to railroad crossing issues and heavy rainfall over the past several weeks). The Board received the Executive Director’s Report as information.

12. Other Business, If Any

There was no other business to discuss.

13. Public Comments, If Any

There was one public comment: William Hamilton, Executive Director of Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, distributed material regarding Summerville, Lincolville and Ladson related to bus rapid transit connections. Mr. Hamilton introduced interns and they spoke about their door-to-door survey experiences.

14. Board Comments, If Any

- Mr. Owens commented on the Town of Mt. Pleasant assisting with zoning set-backs for potential Park & Ride sites; he also commented that he will meet with the Town's Transportation Director regarding the shelter at Wando High School.
- Mayor Tecklenburg inquired about the timeline regarding the BRT. Sharon Hollis, Principal Planner, explained the NEPA process and schedule of approximately 1-1½ years.
- Ms. Johnson commended on service going to Folly Beach and the ReThink Folly Road Plans.
- Ms. Jamison commended CARTA and Rawle-Murdy staff regarding keeping the community involved with the new Rivers Avenue Park & Ride location.
- Chairman Seekings thanked the Board for their participation and for attending today's meeting.

15. Adjourn

There being no further business before the Board, Chairman Seekings adjourned the meeting at 2:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Kim Coleman