



**CHARLESTON AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY**

---

## **CARTA BOARD MEETING**

**October 24, 2018**

**1:00 PM**

Lonnie Hamilton III Public Service Building  
4045 Bridgeview Drive, Room B-225  
North Charleston, SC 29405

### **AGENDA**

1. Call to Order
2. Consideration of Board Minutes – September 19, 2018 Meeting
3. Financial Status Report – Robin Mitchum
4. Shelter/Bench Installation Project – Status Report – Andrea Kozloski
5. Regional Transit Framework Plan Presentation - Sharon Hollis
6. Marketing/Outreach Report - Daniel Brock
7. Executive Director's Report
8. Other Business, If Any
9. Public Comments, If Any
10. Board Comments, If Any
11. Adjournment

*Please note that the next regularly scheduled meeting of the CARTA Board will be November 28, 2018 in Room B-225 of the Lonnie Hamilton III Public Service Building, 4045 Bridgeview Drive, North Charleston, SC 29405. Notice, including agenda documentation, will be sent to Board Members in advance of the meeting, as well as posted on [www.ridecarta.com](http://www.ridecarta.com). The CARTA Board Meetings are broadcast live on Charleston County's Ustream Channel at <https://www.charlestoncounty.org/departments/county-council/cctv.php>.*

**CHARLESTON AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY**  
**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING**  
**September 19, 2018**

The Charleston Area Regional Transportation Authority (CARTA) Board of Directors met on Wednesday, September 19, 2018, at the Lonnie Hamilton III Public Service Building, Room B-225, in North Charleston, South Carolina.

**MEMBERSHIP:** Ed Astle; Mary Beth Berry; Bob Brimmer; Dwayne Green; Alfred Harrison; Virginia Jamison; James Lewis; Minnie Newman; Pat O'Neil; Jim Owens; Vic Rawl; Dickie Schweers; Michael Seekings; Elliott Summey; Keith Summey; John Tecklenburg; Jimmy Ward; Craig Weaver

**MEMBERSHIP PRESENT:** Mary Beth Berry; Bob Brimmer; Dwayne Green; James Lewis; Vic Rawl; Mike Seekings; Jimmy Ward

**PROXIES:** Dennis Turner for Minnie Newman; Jerry Lahm for Elliott Summey; Michael Mathis for John Tecklenburg; Warwick Jones for Dickie Schweers; Lynn Christian for Alfred Harrison; Ray Anderson for Keith Summey

**STAFF PRESENT:** Ron Mitchum; Andrea Kozloski; Robin Mitchum; Heather Brady; Sharon Hollis; Jeff Burns; Michelle Emerson; Kim Coleman

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Michael Mathis (City of Charleston); David Bonner (Transdev); Daniel Brock (Rawle-Murdy Associates); Lindsey Lubanski (Rawle-Murdy); Ben Tamsky (Rawle-Murdy); Renee Miller-Cotton (SCDOT/OPT); David Burgess (SCDOT/Public Transit); William Hamilton (public); Julia Hamilton (public); Jen Gibson (public)

**1. Call to Order**

Chairman Seekings called the CARTA Board of Directors Meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. followed by a moment of silence.

**2. Consideration of Board Minutes: August 22, 2018 Meeting**

***Mr. Lahm made a motion to approve the August 22, 2018 Meeting Minutes as presented. Mr. Ward seconded the motion. The motion was approved with one nay vote.***

**3. Financial Status Report – Robin Mitchum**

Robin Mitchum, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, presented the financial status report for the period ending August 31, 2018. She noted that the agency ended the month with an excess of revenue of \$1,285,300.

- The budget to actual revenues for the month was mostly on target with projections:
  - The actual federal revenue includes operating and capital for the year-to-date.
  - The State Mass Transit Funds are being used as a match for urban funds and bus facility funds.
  - SC Department of Transportation revenue includes funds received for services rendered during the Wando Bridge Closing.
  - Insurance proceeds are a result of accidents.
  - Sales of Assets include the sale of four support vehicles and three cutaways.
- The budget to actual expenditures for the month was mostly on target with projections with the exception of the following items:
  - Printing includes costs of printing route maps, brochures and passes.

- Marketing includes costs associated with promoting the transit system.
- Automotive costs include both parking expenses and mileage reimbursements to employees.
- Accounting (Auditing) cost is the fees for the annual audit.
- Dues include the annual membership fee to the Charleston Metro Chamber of Commerce.
- Office Equipment Rental includes the quarterly postage meter rental fee and the cost of the portable toilet rental for the HOP lot.
- Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) includes the maintenance renewal of Swiftly Transit Time Software and Cradlepoint software in addition to other IT support.
- Rent includes the Rivers Avenue Park-N-Ride lot, Ashley Phosphate Park-N-Ride lot, Leeds Avenue lot lease from SCE&G, SC Works Trident lease space and document storage.
- Professional Services include legal fees, payroll processing system fees and the cost of the security guard for the HOP lot.
- Contract Services (IGA & Management) is the extensive services provided to CARTA.
- Vehicle Maintenance is the cost to maintain the fleet.
- Operating Fees & Licenses include credit card transaction fees, DMV fees, storm water fees and solid waste fees.
- Insurance includes the cost of liability insurance provided by the Insurance Reserve Fund.
- Security cameras include the purchase of additional cameras at the Super Stop, Leeds Avenue and additional security cameras for rolling stock.
- Depreciation includes the quarterly fiscal year 2018 depreciation expense.

Ms. Mitchum also reviewed the HOP expenditures. As of August 31, 2018, total expenditures for the HOP program are \$520,635. Mr. Jones commented on revenues being below projections and they continue to decline. Chairman Seekings commented that the HOP service is a pilot project.

The Board received the Financial Overview/Status Report as information.

#### 4. **FY19 Budget – Request for Approval – Robin Mitchum**

Ms. Mitchum presented the FY18/19 Proposed Budget noting that all member governments have approved the proposed budget as presented.

- Revenues (a detailed explanation of line item changes includes the following):
  - Farebox and Passes Revenue include projections based on current year activity.
  - HOP Lot Parking Fees are the parking fees received at the HOP lot.
  - Federal – This includes estimated 5307 Urban funds, the drawdown and utilization of the Intermodal Center funds and discretionary funds to purchase new commuter buses.
  - State Mass Transit Funds – This increase reflects additional funds for vehicle replacements.
  - Sales Tax - Charleston County – The increase in this line item reflects the actual County contribution from the 1<sup>st</sup> half-cent sales tax and the 2<sup>nd</sup> half-cent sales tax.
  - Charleston County – Intermodal revenue is the cash on hand. It is projected that these funds will be expended in FY18.
- Expenditures (the majority of the changes in expenditures are reflected in the capital expenses related to the intermodal facility construction, rolling stock and other capital items – details follow):
  - Staff salaries and benefits – The increase reflects the increase in employer contributions for retirement, FICA and insurance benefits.
  - Marketing – The decrease is due to Community Pride funds received and projected to be expended in FY18.
  - Accounting (Auditing) – The decrease is the change in the audit service providers.

- Office Equipment Rental – The increase is mostly due to the HOP lot expenditures for a portable toilet rental.
- Office Equipment Maintenance (OEM) – The increase includes software maintenance; it also includes additional software to manage route run times.
- Rent – The decrease is from the termination of the Park & Ride lot on Rivers Avenue.
- Professional Services – This line was increased for projections to include the HOP lot security guard.
- Contract Services – This line decreased with the completion of the Melnick Property Engineering.
- Insurance – The Insurance Reserve Fund has projected increases from 10-15% across their services provided.
- Fixed Route – This line item increased by 3% based with the renewal of the Transdev contract for an additional year.
- Paratransit – This line item increased by 3% based with the renewal of the Transdev contract for an additional year.
- Intermodal Infrastructure Construction – The increase reflects the completion of the Intermodal Center.
- Rolling Stock – This line item reflects the amount of funds we have available for the acquisition of commuter buses and vehicle replacement funds through SCDOT.
- Bus Shelter Construction/Bench Installation – The budget includes estimated 5307 funds for Safety and Security in addition to previously awarded 5307 funds.
- Capital – This line item includes funds for Facility Maintenance, signage and other capital assets related to the operation of the transit system.

Ms. Mitchum noted that the budget will continue to be monitored to insure revenues and expenditures remain aligned and that she is aware of a revision that will be made and additional revisions will be recommended as necessary. Chairman Seekings inquired about the revision that is predicted at this time and Ms. Mitchum responded it is additional federal funds that will be received after October 1<sup>st</sup>. Mr. Jones questioned the HOP lot vehicle turnover based on 4 vehicles. Ms. Mitchum responded that she has not addressed vehicle turnover; the numbers are based on all parking spaces being filled one time a day (however not all spaces are filled in a day).

***Mr. Anderson made a motion to approve the FY19 Proposed Budget as presented. Mr. Lahm seconded the motion. The motion was approved with one nay vote.***

#### **5. Title VI Plan – Request for Approval – Jeff Burns**

Jeff Burns, Senior Planner, presented the Title VI Plan. The Title VI Plan protects any person in the United States on the grounds of race, color or national origin from being excluded from participation, be denied the benefits of, or be otherwise subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving federal financial assistance from the Department of Transportation. CARTA is required to update its Title VI Plan every three years. The document was distributed to the Board of Directors in advance of the meeting for their review. Mr. Burns explained that the only changes from the previous version are updated demographic information for the region and the addition of a section on emergency preparedness, response, mitigation and recovery activities. Mr. Lahm inquired about Appendix A being available online and Mr. Burns responded the form is available online. Mr. Lahm also pointed out the date of 1999 on Appendix D. Mr. Burns stated that it is probably an error and it will be looked into and revised.

***Chief Turner made a motion to approve the Title VI Plan with the proviso that the date reflected on the Policy/Procedures Appendix D is corrected. Mr. Green seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

#### **6. Asset Management Plan – Overview – Jeff Burns**

Mr. Burns presented the Transit Asset Management Plan. He noted that the FTA published the final rule on Transit Asset Management (TAM) on July 26, 2016. It mandated that FTA develop a rule to establish a strategic and systematic process of operating, maintaining and improving public transportation capital assets effectively through their entire life cycle. The rule requires FTA grantees to develop asset management plans for their public

transportation assets, including vehicles, facilities, equipment and other infrastructure. CARTA established the goal of achieving and maintaining a state of good repair for its public transportation assets. TAM will be a business model that uses transit asset condition to guide the optimal prioritization of funding. FTA has defined State of Good Repair (SGR) as the condition in which a capital asset is able to operate at a full level of performance. A capital asset is in a SGR when it is able to perform its designed function, does not pose a known unacceptable safety risk and its lifecycle investments must have been met or recovered. Mr. Brimmer expressed his concerns regarding safety and asked if safety measures are weighted. Mr. Mitchum responded that safety measures are not weighted but agrees that safety and security issues are of high importance and, as such, the agency has taken extra measures by installing improved camera and lighting systems as well as state of the art recording systems. Mr. Jones made an inquiry regarding the TAM Plan making a big difference in the agency's plans. Chairman Seekings responded the TAM Plan has made a tremendous difference and also puts the agency's accountability at a much higher level and results in the agency adhering to the plan. Mr. Jones then inquired if the accountability is to the Federal government. Mr. Mitchum and Chairman Seekings explained it is not only to the Federal government but to the County, to riders and to any other entity that provides funding for the system. Mr. Jones then asked how assets are valued. Mr. Burns responded by book value (purchase price with depreciation factored in). Ms. Berry inquired about the cost difference between battery/electric and diesel vehicles. Mr. Mitchum explained the differences, noting the battery/electric vehicles are much more expensive by approximately \$250 thousand. Mr. Mitchum then discussed the impacts of battery/electric vehicles, the cost, the maintenance and grant funding.

***Mr. Green made a motion to approve the Asset Management Plan as presented. Mr. Rawl seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.***

**7. Hospitality on Peninsula Service – Ron Mitchum**

Ron Mitchum, Executive Director, announced there is a HOP Subcommittee meeting scheduled for 2pm Monday at the Lonnie Hamilton III Public Service building and opened the invitation to Board Members and interested members of the public. Mr. Mitchum also noted he will go before the County's Finance Committee on October 18<sup>th</sup> to discuss HOP funding and will be able to report the plan back to the Board as soon as it is available. Mr. Rawl inquired about the demographics of users of the HOP service. Ms. Hollis responded demographics were obtained through surveys and the results will be shared with the Board as she did not have the survey results with her at the time of the meeting. However, Chairman Seekings noted ridership comes from all areas in the region. Mr. Rawl then highly suggested that the agency look into expanding the HOP lot to the former Naval Hospital location as soon as practical. He noted the reasons being that the County is already spending money on the security of the location (it is fenced-in and there is a guard shack and a convenient location). Mr. Mitchum stated that the agency is looking into the Naval Hospital option as well as the Mt. Pleasant Street option. Mr. Jones commented that the HOP continues to operate in a deficit and inquired about the length of time it would take for the Naval Hospital property to become a HOP lot. Mr. Rawl clarified that the Naval Hospital property does not necessarily need to be used only for the HOP but perhaps a Park & Ride location. Chairman Seekings recognized that the program is expensive to operate; however, funding concerns have improved since the last Board meeting. He stated that, at last night's City Council meeting, the City approved an additional \$20 thousand a month funding from the increased parking meter revenue as well as contributing approximately \$47 thousand from the City's remaining funds of capital upgrade in improvements. In addition, the hospitality industry has committed to \$15 thousand a month funding. We are making progress but will continue to seek additional sources of revenue.

**8. Shelter/Bench Installation Project – Status Report – Andrea Kozloski**

Andrea Kozloski, Deputy Director of Operations and Support, presented the Shelter/Bench Installation Project Status Report. She will continue to update the Board on a monthly basis until the completion of the project. Ms. Kozloski noted that installation will occur as deliveries are received. Once an installation is completed, the Board will be invited to attend the respective ribbon-cutting ceremonies. She then stated that all shelter and bench locations on Dorchester Road have been marked. She presented slides of the Ashley Phosphate at Brandywine shelter installation, the site-preps of Pepperidge and Windsor Hill at Ashley Phosphate, the bench installation at Patriot Boulevard at Ashley Phosphate and the advertising bench installation at Peppermill Parkway and Ashley Phosphate. The Board received the Shelter/Bench Installation Project Status Report as information.

## 9. Project Status Reports – Sharon Hollis

- A. **Regional Transit Framework Plan:** Sharon Hollis, Principal Planner, delivered the Regional Transit Framework Plan update. She noted that the final report is being developed and should be completed October 1<sup>st</sup>.
- B. **Regional Park-N-Ride Study:** Ms. Hollis delivered an update on the Regional Park-N-Ride Study. She discussed the additional concept design for the Mt. Pleasant Street parcel and the final report should be completed October 1<sup>st</sup>.
- C. **Intermodal Center:** Ms. Hollis noted that the anticipated project complete date is March 2019.
- D. **Lowcountry Rapid Transit:** Ms. Hollis noted that Phase 1 of the Project Kick-Off will be in October.
- E. **Mt. Pleasant Planning Project:** Ms. Hollis noted that a findings report is being developed and should be drafted by October 1<sup>st</sup>.

The Board received the Project Status Reports as information.

## 10. Marketing/Outreach Report – Daniel Brock

Daniel Brock, with Rawle-Murdy Associates, presented the Marketing/Outreach Report. He updated the Board on Social Media engagements, link clicks and APP statistics. Mr. Brock also discussed HOP ridership, the Mt. Pleasant Transit Study, “Seniors Ride Free Day,” electric bus funding as well as the various media outreach throughout the month of August. The Board received the Marketing/Outreach Report as information.

## 11. Executive Director’s Report

Mr. Mitchum highlighted the following matters:

- Mr. Mitchum commended COG and Transdev staff for their planning efforts, route adjustments, evacuation assistance, etc. during Hurricane Florence. A follow-up meeting will be held tomorrow to develop an action report and discuss future recommendations.
- A \$3.8 million discretionary grant has been approved and three additional commuter buses have been ordered under the current contract with Gillig.
- The Low-No Grant application was successful and the agency is beginning to work with Proterra on the details of the vehicles. We are anticipating 2-3 buses being purchased with leased battery systems (12- year batteries).
- The bus wash system is scheduled to be installed this week.
- A meeting will be scheduled with SCE&G to discuss the property adjacent to the Leeds Avenue facility.
- Discussions are being held regarding service for hospitality workers on the Isle of Palms.
- Reports were distributed prior to the start of the meeting which included ridership summary statistics, the monthly performance snapshot, upcoming events and activities.

The Board received the Executive Director’s report as information.

## 12. Other Business, If Any

No further business was discussed.

## 13. Public Comments, If Any

There were two public comments:

- William Hamilton, of Best Friends of Lowcountry Transit, thanked the Board Members for their service. He noted the improvements on the shelters are greatly appreciated. Mr. Hamilton spoke of the differences between the HOP and DASH services. He also shared his thoughts on the public’s anticipated reaction to the news of electric buses. He then spoke about Best Friends of the Lowcountry Transit’s outreach efforts and upcoming events.
- Jen Gibson, of Daniel Island, thanked the agency for holding the public meeting on Daniel Island. Ms. Gibson is committed to assisting with mass transit to Daniel Island.

**14. Board Comments, If Any**

- Chief Turner commended CARTA for its work during the hurricane evacuation process. He noted that because of CARTA getting individuals to shelters, it helped ease law enforcement’s workload with that particular task during a crucial time.
- Mr. Green recommended that Keith Benjamin, City of Charleston’s Transportation Director, serve on the HOP Subcommittee as he would bring a lot to the table regarding the HOP service.
- Ms. Berry thanked Mr. Mitchum for providing the handout on Greater Washington Transit.
- Chairman Seekings thanked everyone for their hard work during Hurricane Florence and is looking forward to reviewing the post-action reports.

**15. Adjourn**

There being no further business before the Board, Chairman Seekings adjourned the meeting at 2:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Kim Coleman

DRAFT